

Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board

Arlington County, Virginia

HALRB Case 18-25 (HP1800053)



A request by Asghar Shahmoradi and Maryam Amiryan, owners of 2337 North Fillmore Street in the Maywood Historic District, to be granted a setback modification to allow for the infill of the existing carport.



CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: HALRB
FROM: Angelina Jones, Historic Preservation Planner
DATE: November 21, 2018
SUBJECT: 2337 North Fillmore Street, Case 18-25, Maywood Historic District

Background Information

This split-level dwelling is located at 2337 North Fillmore Street within the Maywood Local Historic District. Built in 1960, the three-bay, side gabled dwelling is faced with stretcher bond brick coursing. Fenestration includes a recessed entryway featuring a four-panel, two-light wood door with three-light sidelights and vinyl-sash windows. The roof is pierced by an interior brick chimney. The carport on the north side of the dwelling appears to be original to the building's construction based on historic aerial photos and the building permit index records for the property. The subject dwelling is not listed in the Maywood National Register Historic District and is considered a "post-historic period property" in the Maywood Local Historic District.

Proposal

The applicant is requesting to infill the existing carport to create additional interior living space. This action would require the HALRB to recommend that the Zoning Administrator modify the underlying setbacks on the subject property. The carport is sited approximately 2'-6" from the northern property line, which means that the wall along the property boundary could not have any openings as per §R302.1 of the 2012 Virginia residential building code.

DRC Review

The Design Review Committee (DRC) heard this application at its November 7, 2018 meeting. The DRC requested that the applicant provide additional documentation of the infill design being proposed including a sketch of the primary elevation with fenestration if known. The DRC stated that they would consider infill in this location pending review of a design proposal. The committee commented that consideration of whether a setback modification should be granted must be considered by the full HALRB and recommended it be placed on the discussion agenda for the November 28, 2018, HALRB hearing.

Staff Recommendation

At this point in the process, the HALRB is primarily being asked to decide whether a setback modification is appropriate as there is not yet a comprehensive design proposal for the project. Section 15.7.4 of the Arlington County Zoning Ordinance (ACZO) states:

As part of the certificate of appropriateness review process, the Review Board may find that the proposed setback for buildings and structures is consistent with the existing streetscape and historic district design guidelines even though such setback is inconsistent with the requirements of the underlying zoning district. When the Review Board makes this finding, the zoning administrator shall grant a modification to the underlying setbacks, unless such modification violates visual clearance requirements from §3.2.6.A.4.

Given the language of the ACZO, the HALRB is being asked to consider the appropriateness of a proposed setback modification by 1) examining its potential impact on the streetscape and 2) assessing whether it is in accordance with the applicable design guidelines.

To the first point, infill of the carport would not have a noticeable impact on the rhythm of spacing between properties given the lack of uniformity of spacing between buildings on this block due to the curve of North Fillmore Street and a dramatic topographic change. The subject dwelling is sited approximately 30' from the residence to the north and approximately 50' from the residence to the south. However, the proposal would increase the visual impact of the horizontal massing of the house by infilling the carport.

To the second point, Chapter 6: New Addition/Building of the *Maywood Design Guidelines* states that, "In most cases, the new addition should not be prominently visible from the street and should be located to the rear of the house, if possible (p.27)." Therefore, this proposal is inconsistent with the *Maywood Design Guidelines* since it is possible for an addition to be constructed at the rear of the property, although the topographic slope would make it challenging.

Although this is not a contributing property, the design guidelines apply to all buildings in the historic district and the defining features of this style of house should be considered when applying the guidelines. Split-level dwellings were designed according to a dominant mid-twentieth century theory of domestic interior organization that asserted that families needed three different types of living areas: noisy/active spaces, quiet spaces, and sleeping quarters. The three distinct levels of this house type accommodated each of these different activities on separate floors. The garages or carports were intentionally incorporated into the active spaces of these houses, sited immediately adjacent to the area meant to be a family room with a television set. The carport is a character defining feature of this domestic architectural style directly tied into the spatial organization of the structure.

Staff recommends denial of the subject application. The proposal does not meet the stipulations stated in Section 15.7.4 of the ACZO that allows the HALRB to recommend a setback modification to the Zoning Administrator, specifically adherence to the historic district design guidelines. Additionally, the enclosure of the carport would be a prominently visible alteration on the front façade, thereby not meeting the intent of Chapter 6: New Addition/Building of the *Maywood Design Guidelines*.



DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY PLANNING, HOUSING AND DEVELOPMENT

Neighborhood Services Division

Courthouse Plaza One 2100 Clarendon Boulevard, Suite 700 Arlington, VA 22201
TEL 703.228.3830 www.arlingtonva.us

November 8, 2018

Asghar Shahmoradi and Maryam Amiryan
2337 North Fillmore Street
Arlington, VA 22207

**RE: Design Review Committee Report
2337 North Fillmore Street
Certificate of Appropriateness 18-25
Maywood Historic District**

Mr. Shahmoradi and Ms. Amiryan:

The Design Review Committee (DRC) of the Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB) reviewed your request for a setback modification to allow for infilling your existing carport at its November 7, 2018, meeting. The DRC recommended that your item be placed on the discussion agenda for the November 28, 2018, HALRB hearing. The DRC made no formal recommendation to the board, but suggested that you provide additional documentation of the infill design that you are proposing.

Please submit the following information by **November 20, 2018**:

1. A sketch of your proposal indicating the design for the infill of the garage, including fenestration if known.

This information will allow for the HALRB to have a full discussion of the merits of the proposal and render a decision on the application at the hearing.

The Historic Preservation Program staff and the HALRB will evaluate the proposal with respect to the Arlington County Zoning Ordinance, *Maywood Design Guidelines*, and precedent cases set by the HALRB.

The agenda and materials for the HALRB meeting will be posted online at:
<https://commissions.arlingtonva.us/historical-affairs-landmark-review-board/>

If you have any questions or need additional assistance, please do not hesitate to call the Historic Preservation Program Office at 703-228-3838.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Angelina R. Jones". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial 'A' and a distinct 'R'.

Angelina R. Jones
Historic Preservation Staff
cc: Serena Bolliger