



DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY PLANNING, HOUSING AND DEVELOPMENT
Neighborhood Services Division

Courthouse Plaza One 2100 Clarendon Boulevard, Suite 700 Arlington, VA 22201
TEL 703.228.3830 FAX 703.228.3834 www.arlingtonva.us

MINUTES OF THE HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD
Wednesday, September 19, 2018
2100 Clarendon Boulevard
Lobby Rooms Cherry and Dogwood

MEMBERS PRESENT: Sarah Afragola
Charles Craig
Omari Davis
Robert Dudka
Sarah Garner
Joan Lawrence, Chairman
Mark Turnbull
Andrew Wenchel
Richard Woodruff, Vice Chairman

MEMBERS EXCUSED: Carmela Hamm
Gerry Laporte
Sara Steinberger

STAFF: Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Historic Preservation Coordinator
John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner
Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Specialist

ROLL CALL & CALL TO ORDER

The Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:30 PM. Mr. Liebertz called the roll and determined there was a quorum. Ms. Liccese-Torres noted that Ms. Jennie Gwin would be sitting in on the meeting as she was going to be appointed to the HALRB next week at the recessed County Board meeting. The Chairman inquired as to how many members were on the HALRB now. Ms. Liccese-Torres responded there were 13 with two vacancies remaining.

APPROVAL OF THE AUGUST 15, 2018, MEETING MINUTES

The Chairman called for any changes to the August 15, 2018, draft meeting minutes. Ms. Afragola noted that her first name was misspelled. Mr. Turnbull moved to approve the draft minutes and Mr. Craig seconded the motion. The motion passed 8-0-1, with Mr. Woodruff abstaining.

PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS (CoAs)

The Chairman stated there were four items on the Consent Agenda:

1. Ginger Brown
5151 14th Street North
CoA 16-16G (HP1800034)
Broadview Historic District
Request to amend CoA 16-16F to alter the design of the greenhouse/storage shed.
2. Ibrahim Al Amin
2415 Shirlington Road
CoA 18-13A (HP1800042)
Green Valley Pharmacy Historic District
Request to install a metal cap on the parapet.
3. Carol Parker
3505 22nd Street North
CoA 18-17 (HP1800037)
Maywood Historic District
Request to install a hand rail on the step in the front yard.
4. Elizabeth Stroot
3603 22nd Street North
CoA 18-20 (HP1800040)
Maywood Historic District
Request to install a vent on the side elevation.

The Chairman called for any questions or comments on the consent agenda. There were none. Mr. Woodruff moved to approve the consent agenda. Mr. Turnbull seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

The Chairman stated there were no Administrative CoAs.

DISCUSSION AGENDA

The Chairman stated there were three items on the discussion agenda. Mr. Liebertz invited the applicants to the table as their item was called.

1. Jarrod Tsukada & Alison Jones
2330 North Jackson Street
CoA 18-04C (HP1800034)
Maywood Historic District
Request to amend CoA 18-04 for the replacement of the shed roof on the rear of the building.
2. Karen T. Sullivan & Charles R. Nelson

2325 North Van Buren Court
CoA 18-18 (HP1800038)
Eastman-Fenwick House Historic District
Request to replace 25 windows.

3. Tom & Christina Gelson
2314 North Kenmore Street
CoA 18-03B (HP1800035)
Maywood Historic District
Request to amend CoA 18-03A to alter the approved design and landscape.

Discussion Agenda Item #1: 2330 North Jackson Street

Mr. Liebertz provided the staff report detailing the proposed amendment to the existing CoA. He stated the upon removing the ceiling of their addition, the owners discovered that the sheet metal roof was leaking, lacked structural integrity, and warranted replacement. The material itself was not of a type to be replaced in-kind; instead the owners applied to replace it with asphalt shingle. Mr. Dudka explained that at the Design Review Committee (DRC) meeting, they discussed that the low roof slope would make the area inappropriate for asphalt shingle, but the additional documentation provided this evening with regards to the actual slope of the roof makes the requested material appropriate in this case. After some discussion about visibility from neighbors and other types of materials, the HALRB agreed that the rear roof material was not a character-defining feature of the house and a material change in this case would not have an effect to a character defining architectural feature. The Chairman moved to approve the CoA request to replace the roof with asphalt shingles because the roof was deemed not a character defining feature of the resource and not visible. Mr. Woodruff seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Liebertz next asked the HALRB to consider an informal review of another item recently discovered by the same applicants; this would give guidance to the owners to help them prepare for a later CoA application. Upon removing some siding for the installation of an electrical box, the owners discovered that the siding labeled as “wood” on their architectural drawings was Masonite overlaid on another layer of artificial siding. The applicants believed cementitious fiberboard siding would be the closest material to an in-kind replacement and inquired about re-siding the house. Since the item was not advertised on this month’s agenda, Mr. Liebertz explained that the HALRB would not be able to vote on the issue this evening. Instead, he wanted to give the applicants an idea of the options the board would consider.

The HALRB discussed the sub-material which could either be asphalt or asbestos, and it was assumed it was asbestos tile based on the texture and damage visible in the provided images. HPP staff stated that the asphalt shingle or asbestos shingle was not likely the original cladding material. Mr. Dudka stated that cementitious fiberboard would be the equivalent of asbestos shingle or Masonite. However, Mr. Liebertz explained that the *Maywood Design Guidelines* clearly state that cementitious fiberboard is not a material that would be considered for cladding on the historic part of a home. Mr. Dudka warned against using wood siding to create a false

sense of the historic appearance of the home. Without evidence of any original cladding materials, the recommendations were inconclusive.

Discussion Item: Technical Amendments to the Fenwick Court Townhomes Design Guidelines

Before beginning the second discussion item, given its related nature, Mr. Liebertz introduced several proposed technical amendments to the *Fenwick Court Townhomes Design Guidelines*. The amendments address some discrepancies related to window details and trim, as well as correct outdated references to the Arlington County Zoning Ordinance (ACZO). A summary of proposed additions/edits is as follows:

- An option to cap a window with metal or PVC, in addition to wood (page 2);
- A range to the width dimensions for muntins since many muntins run at ¾” rather than 1” (page 3);
- Comprehensive information about window trim (page 3);
- An option to use cementitious fiberboard and PVC on certain elements of the buildings in the local historic district (page 6);
- Amended language about historic accuracy and replaced it with language about consistency (page 7); and
- Updated references to the ACZO throughout the guidelines.

Mr. Woodruff moved to approve the amendments, and Ms. Garner seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Discussion Agenda Item #2: 2325 North Van Buren Court

The applicants asked why their property and that of their neighbors would be subject to the design guidelines since they are situated on a private drive and their homes are not technically visible from the public right-of-way. Mr. Liebertz responded that the design guidelines were created to ensure that changes in the historic district are compatible with and appropriate to the historic Eastman-Fenwick House. The HALRB had no questions about the CoA request. Mr. Woodruff moved to approve the application. Mr. Craig seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Discussion Agenda Item #3: 2314 North Kenmore Street

Mr. Liebertz introduced the third item on the discussion agenda and summarized the proposed amendments to the house renovation at 2314 North Kenmore Street.

Mr. Liebertz noted the applicants’ request to use cementitious fiberboard trim instead of cellular PVC trim. He noted that the Maywood Design Guidelines do not permit the use of cementitious fiberboard trim. Mr. Dudka asked if cementitious fiberboard had been approved before [in the district]. The Chairman replied that it had been approved as siding on non-historic additions. The applicant distributed some material samples. The Chairman said that if the applicant felt strongly about using this material, then the HALRB could initiate a community process necessary to amend the *Maywood Design Guidelines*, but it would require further outreach which might take several months. Given the process involved, the applicant decided to proceed with PVC trim. Mr. Dudka added that he did not think the cementitious trim was appropriate.

Mr. Dudka discussed DRC's preference for the staggered shingle option available from Hardie.

Mr. Liebertz reminded the applicant that the siding texture was required to be smooth.

The Chairman moved to approve the proposed amendments as outlined in the staff report pending staff review of any outstanding items or specifications. Mr. Turnbull seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

[At 8:26 pm the Chairman left to attend a prior commitment; the Vice Chairman assumed leadership of the remainder of the meeting.]

Discussion Item: Additional Servicemen for WWI Memorial

Mr. Liebertz provided an update on the ongoing World War One (WWI) memorial project sponsored by the County's WWI Commemoration Task Force. As part of his research, he discovered several new names that had not been included on the original plaque cast in 1931 to honor Arlington's WWI dead. He reminded the board that a memo been distributed at the August HALRB meeting for review. Mr. Liebertz asked the board to consider and vote on the legitimacy of the Arlington residency of those identified to finalize the list of dead for future inclusion on the Clarendon War Memorial or other interpretation. After a brief explanation of findings by Mr. Liebertz, the HALRB members had the opportunity to ask questions about each service member. Mr. Woodruff made a motion for each name as follows:

1. Carl Christensen- Moved to recommend inclusion, motion passed unanimously.
2. William McKeever- Moved to recommend inclusion, motion passed unanimously.
3. Leon Hardin- Moved to recommend inclusion, motion passed unanimously.
4. Thomas Torrance- Moved to recommend inclusion, motion passed unanimously.
5. Ernest Zimmerman- Moved to recommend inclusion, motion passed unanimously.
6. Peyton March, Jr.- Moved to not recommend inclusion, motion passed unanimously.
7. Carl Munch- Moved to not recommend inclusion, motion passed unanimously.

Staff then distributed the most recent draft of the proposed American Legion Memorial marker (previously reviewed by the HALRB in July and August). Mr. Liebertz asked for any last comments on this final draft. Ms. Liccese-Torres said the board also could review it and email comments by next Monday. Since the last iteration, Mr. Liebertz pointed out a few new updates: the change of an image; a new font; the curving of the paragraphs around the bullet points; and the change to standard use of 'monument' throughout the text. Ms. Afragola and Ms. Garner both commented that 'Today' in the timeline should be written in block capitals. Mr. Turnbull asked if any future plaque at the site would mention that the additional names had been discovered and added at a later date. Ms. Liccese-Torres responded that inclusion of these names is still being considered and such inclusion would be identified as having been added at a later date.

Staff and Other Reports:

Mr. Woodruff asked about upcoming preservation education opportunities. Ms. Liccese-Torres discussed the Preservation Virginia conference to be held in Danville, VA in mid-October. She

also asked board members to inform her throughout the year of any education requirements they complete. Mr. Woodruff inquired about additional opportunities in the immediate area. Mr. Craig mentioned high quality programming at the National Building Museum often sponsored by the American Institute of Architects (AIA.) Ms. Gwin asked about the education requirements. She also said that she was on the board of the local Docomomo chapter and announced an upcoming tour on October 14. The tour will extend from Pennsylvania Avenue to Freedom Plaza and will explore the DC WWI memorial; the tour which would qualify for AIA continuing education credits.

Mr. Liebertz reported that the Reevesland historic preservation easement had been recorded earlier in the month to protect the house in perpetuity from demolition.

Mr. Liebertz reminded the board that the next meeting of the Maywood Design Guidelines committee will be on October 17. Ms. Liccese-Torres reminded the HALRB that any substantial changes to the design guidelines, including increasing staff administrative approval opportunities, would need to be presented at an HALRB public hearing, as well as to the County Board.

Mr. Turnbull asked whether the HALRB should consider an alternative date for the November meeting since the regular date falls on the day before Thanksgiving. Ms. Liccese-Torres explained that it would be easier to push the meeting back one week because of the legal notification requirements. The board agreed to reschedule the November HALRB hearing to November 28.

Ms. Liccese-Torres mentioned that a nominating committee needs to be chosen no later than November for the December election of next year's HALRB officers.

The meeting adjourned at 9:04 pm.