

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)
FROM: Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Planner
DATE: April 8, 2021
SUBJECT: 2821 23rd Street North, CoA 21-06, Maywood Local Historic District

Background Information

The two-story Colonial Revival dwelling at 2821 23rd Street North was constructed in 1953 and is listed as a non-contributing resource in the *Maywood National Register Nomination*. The description is as follows:

The three-bay-wide, concrete-block masonry dwelling rests on a solid brick foundation. It is faced with 6:1 Flemish bond, and has a side-gable roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. Windows are 1x1 vinyl-sash, and there is a fixed plate glass window flanked by eight-light horizontal sliding windows. Other notable features include 2 front-gable dormers clad in vinyl siding, simulated louvered shutters, rowlock sills, a wood fascia, and a stylized Colonial Revival entry surround with a denticulated entablature

Proposal

The applicant is requesting to demolish the existing two-level rear deck and replace it with a two-story covered and screened octagonal porch with a hot tub in the bottom level. The applicant also wants to construct a 'boardwalk' wrapping from the front of the dwelling to the rear with a trellis from the top of the boardwalk handrail in some instances to the ground.

The proposed porch is an octagonal two-story structure where the upper level is screened with a stained wood MiniTrack and MeshGuard screen systems. The proposed decking material is Aeratis Legacy T&G. The lower level patio would be South Blue Flagstone with Weston stone retaining walls and steps. The partially sunk hot tub will be 90"x90"x36" and surrounded by removable floorboards in the Aeratis decking. The roof would have asphalt shingles on the octagonal structure and would be flat white EPDM on the porch connection to the house; both have 6" aluminum box gutters and round downspouts.

The proposed 'boardwalk' handrail would be the Accoya trellis with a vertical element and a diagonal trellis element. It would run approximately 34' along the southeast side of the house. The trellis would run from the handrail to grade for the first approximately 10' of walkway, then run only the height of the handrail for 24' before arriving at the deck, which would have the trellis run from the handrail height to grade. The 'boardwalk' would end in an open deck connected to the new screened walkway and porch. The proposed decking is Aeratis Legacy T&G.

DRC Review

Due to the public health crisis caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, the Design Review Committee (DRC) has not been able to convene since the owners submitted their CoA application. This item therefore has been placed on the April 21, 2021, HALRB agenda as a discussion item.

Recommendation

The *Maywood Design Guidelines* state that porches are typical of the neighborhood and while enclosure of front porches is not appropriate, enclosure of back porches is not considered inappropriate. Many enclosed porches have been approved in the Maywood Local Historic District (LHD) to increase livable space without negatively affecting historic dwellings. Were the proposed rear porch to be removed, it would not affect the house, which is in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standard for Rehabilitation* #10: "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

Although non-contributing houses within the Maywood LHD are not exempt from design review, non-contributing status may allow for greater flexibility when considering certain kinds of exterior alterations which are not character-defining, not visible from the right-of-way, and not specifically enumerated in the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. Although the design of the proposed porch is more modern than typically found in the LHD, the property is a non-contributing resource and the proposed project would not be visible from the dead-end right-of-way.

The Historic Preservation staff recommends that the applicant consider a simpler design for the 'boardwalk,' with a handrail instead of a trellis and keeping the rail to the height of the walkway, not to the ground. Appendix G of the *Maywood Design Guidelines* recommends that "Railings shall be of a simple design and constructed of metal or wood." The proposed boardwalk design is very modern, and this walkway configuration has not been approved before within the LHD. If it presented more like a wraparound porch, the boardwalk element might feel more appropriate to the character of the LHD from the public right-of-way.