

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)
FROM: Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Planner
DATE: June 9, 2021
SUBJECT: 3301 22nd Street North, CoA 21-12, Maywood Local Historic District

Background Information

The Dutch Colonial dwelling at 3301 22nd Street North was constructed before 1912 and is listed as a contributing resource in the *Maywood National Register Nomination*. The description is as follows:

The three-bay-wide, wood-frame dwelling rests on a solid parged foundation. It is stuccoed on the exterior and has a front-gambrel roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. It has a one-story, three-bay, wood-frame front porch on paneled posts and both six-over-one and one-over-one wood-sash windows. Window and door surrounds are unmolded. Other notable features include a side shed-roof dormer, paneled pilasters, a molded wood cornice, a built-in bench on the front porch and a leaded-glass transom over the front entry.

Proposal

The applicant is requesting to replace the deteriorating 1"x4" tongue and groove front porch decking with Aeratis Heritage composite decking of the same dimension and design.

DRC Review

The Design Review Committee (DRC) heard this application at its June 2, 2021, meeting. The committee asked that the applicant paint the decking to give it the same finish as historic decking in the neighborhood. The DRC recommended that the subject application be placed on the consent agenda for the June 16, 2021, HALRB hearing.

Recommendation

The Historic Preservation staff recommends approval of the subject application. Exterior flooring experiences extreme conditions and casual use, which can deteriorate materials quickly. Historic old-growth wood is very durable but modern wood options often are not aged in a way to make them durable to harsh conditions, leaving them to deteriorate quickly particularly when exposed to water.

The 'Materials' section of Chapter 6: New Building/Addition of the *Maywood Design Guidelines* bases the use of new materials on the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* Preservation Brief 6: The Use of Substitute Materials on Historic Building Exteriors.

The *Maywood Design Guidelines* outline the following:

When deteriorated, damaged, or lost features of a historic building need repair or replacement, it is almost always best to use historic materials. In limited circumstances substitute materials that imitate historic materials may be used if the appearance and properties of the historic materials can be matched closely and no damage to the remaining historic fabric will result.

In dealing with exterior features and materials, it must be remembered that moisture penetration, ultraviolet degradation, and differing thermal expansion and contraction rates of dissimilar materials make any repair or replacement problematic. To ensure that a repair or replacement will perform well over time, it is critical to understand fully the properties of both the original and the substitute materials, to install replacement materials correctly, to assess their impact on adjacent historic materials, and to have reasonable expectations of future performance.

Substitute materials must meet three basic criteria before being considered: they must be compatible with the historic materials in appearance; their physical properties must be similar to those of the historic materials, or be installed in a manner that tolerates differences; and they must meet certain basic performance expectations over an extended period of time.

Aeratis decking has been approved many times in Maywood, most recently on the deck at 2821 23rd Street North (CoA 21-06). The identical dimensions in the subject application, combined with the painted surface, will make the proposed synthetic material appear identical to new painted wooden flooring from the public right-of-way.